

# COMMITMENT MATTERS: HOW PERSONNEL LOYALTY IMPACTS ON EFFECTIVENESS OF LIBRARIES IN PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES

By

LIBRN. FELIX A. ADEWUSI (PHD), (CLN)

## Abstract

University libraries play a vital role in enhancing academic success, learning, research, and community engagement, hence, their effectiveness is crucial in meeting the diverse needs of its users by providing access to information resources and services. Extant studies revealed that libraries in public universities have not been effective as expected. This problem is manifested in a notable drop in the utilization of university libraries' services. A crucial factor that may significantly impact on success in the libraries is commitment of personnel. Studies have been carried out on commitment of personnel and effectiveness independently. However, there was insufficient empirical studies on the subjects hence this study investigated commitment of personnel and its influence on effectiveness of libraries of public universities in South-West, Nigeria. Survey research design was adopted for the study. The population consisted 482 librarians from 15 libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria. Total enumeration was used. A structured and validated questionnaire was used to collect data from the respondents. Cronbach's alpha reliability coefficients for the constructs ranged from 0.89 to 0.94. A response rate of 81 percent was achieved. Data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential (multiple regression) statistics at 5% significant level. Findings showed that personnel commitment had significant influence on the effectiveness of libraries in the public universities ( $\text{Adj.}R^2 = 0.63$ ,  $F(2, 407) = 241.64$ ,  $p < 0.05$ ). It was recommended that public universities should devise a strategic plan involving capacity building that would improve personnel commitment to enhance success of university libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria.

**Keywords:** Effectiveness of university libraries, personnel commitment, affective commitment, Library finance, University Libraries

## Introduction

University libraries play critical function in supporting academic success, learning, research, community engagements and create conducive learning. Thus, the effectiveness of the libraries is essential in meeting the diverse needs of its users through the provision of a range of information resources, services and facilities to support the academic programs and research activities. Effectiveness is related to organizational capability to access and utilize assets in a well-organized manner and to achieve organizational goals. In corroboration, Yadav and Singh

(2022) and Xu et al. (2022) affirmed that organizational effectiveness simply means how well an organization is, in achieving its goals. In the context of this study, effectiveness of library may be referred to the degree to which library services, resources or processes result in the attainment of library goals or outcomes. Effective library systems are expected to be timely in delivery, meet specific needs of users, easy to understand, use, and are delivered by committed, courteous and knowledgeable staff.

Effectiveness of library is manifested in the services outlined by Librarians Registration Council of Nigeria (LRCN) (2014) which states that university library shall carry out the following services: Circulation services; inter-library loan services; reference and information services; current awareness services; Selective Dissemination of Information (SDI); user-education; literature searching; compilation of bibliographies; indexing and abstracting services; knowledge management services; preservation and conservation services; bindery services; information literacy services; information media literacy; internet services; archiving services; knowledge management services; preservation services; bibliographic services; consultancy services; photocopying/reprographic services; publication of guides to the library; compilation and maintenance of statistics; e-library services; translation services; statistical data analysis services; internet services; and book editing services.

Three indicators from Balanced Score Card theory are identified as suitable for measures of effectiveness of university libraries for this study. These are finance perspective, internal processes perspective and innovation perspective. According to Temile (2016), financial perspective takes into account how the library would generate funds or resources in order to maintain strong and sustainable libraries that are fundamental to rebuilding, supportive and contributing to the economic and social lives of the communities. Internal process takes care of how librarians need to always keep an eye on how well their operations are going, they have to embark on operations that can add or create value to the overall growth of the organization. Innovation in the other word is how the library has to be dynamic. Dynamism is measurement or perspective incorporating training of employees and empowering them with adequate knowledge that will enable them cope with challenges of future changes and improvement (Yawson & Paros, 2023). These perspectives are considered critical to the comprehensive value the indicators provide organizations to ensure their actions and behaviors are aligned with their

overall strategic goals. Given that organizations must seek to meet shareholders' expectations, it is paramount that strategic goals are identifiable and measurable in real-time. It is also essential to recognize that if a strategy is at odds with an organizational process or the organizational culture, leaders and managers will encounter resistance to change. Thus, the indicators help librarians to make decisions and to improve services such that mission and strategy of a library are translated into a system of performance indicators.

Commitment of library personnel is one of the various factors that contributes to effectiveness of libraries. It is a critical factor in that it plays a vital role in shaping and projecting the quality of services and resources provided in libraries. Personnel are the backbone of university libraries, responsible for managing collections, assisting patrons, and fostering a conducive learning environment. The level of commitment, enthusiasm, and expertise can significantly impact the library's ability to meet the evolving needs of its users. The indicators for library personnel commitment which include affective, continuance and normative commitments are derived from Three-Dimensional Commitment Model by Meyer and Allen (1991). According to Bankole (2023), affective commitment involves the employees' emotional attachment to, identification with, and involvement in the organization. Affective commitment is considered to be the most desirable manifestation of commitment, because it refers to the emotional connection and identification of employees with the organizations. Employees who have this type of commitment show a high degree of motivation, a strong belief in the goals of the organization, willingness to actively participate in its development.

It is indicated that employees who develop this type of commitment stay in the organization because they want to. Also, Badmus et al. (2022) stressed that continuance commitment on the other hand involves commitment based on the costs that the employee associates with leaving the organization; while normative commitment involves the employees' feelings of obligation to stay within the organization. Normative commitment, as the third type of commitment, reflects the feeling of obligation of employees to stay in the organization for certain reasons such as scholarships, various types of help from the organisation. This group of employees is seen to be important for the organisation because they can achieve high performance.

Despite the importance of personnel contributions, there was scarcity of empirical research investigating the impact of their commitment on library effectiveness. This study aims to address this knowledge gap by examining the relationship between personnel commitment and how their dedication, skills, and passion can enhance the effectiveness of university libraries.

### Statement of the Problem

The place of university libraries in the provision of a range of information resources, services and facilities to support the academic programmes and research activities cannot be overemphasized. Effectiveness of libraries is very crucial in the university system. Okonoko et al. (2022), revealed that the benefits of rendering effective library services to library users are academic advancement, research, reading and promotion. Literature abounded that personnel commitment could improve effectiveness of libraries. However, studies such as Udofia and Ibegwam (2019), revealed that libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria have not been effective as expected. Perhaps the reason for the notable drop in the utilization of university libraries' services. Studies have indicated gross insufficiency of empirical studies on the influence of personnel commitment on effectiveness of libraries in public universities in Nigeria. Thus, this study investigated personnel commitment's impact on effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria.

### Research Questions

1. What is the level of the effectiveness of public university libraries in South-West, Nigeria?
2. What is the level of personnel commitment in public university libraries in South-West, Nigeria?
3. What are the challenges of the effectiveness of public university libraries in South West, Nigeria?

### Hypothesis

The following hypothesis is tested at 0.05 level of significance:

H<sub>01</sub>: Personnel commitment has no significant influence on effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria.

## Literature Review

Achieving effectiveness in library services is considered as the basic responsibility of the library management. Fabunmi (2022), described library effectiveness as including information customized to meet individual needs, stating that effective library systems are timely in delivery, meet their specific needs, are easy to understand/use, and are delivered by courteous and knowledgeable staff. According to Adegun et al. (2015), library effectiveness involved assessing how well a library meets the needs and expectations of its users, as well as the impact it has on individuals, organizations, and society as a whole. The concept of effectiveness of library often encompasses various dimensions, including user satisfaction, accessibility of resources, quality of services, and the library's contribution to education, research, and community development. The ultimate test of effectiveness of library is the satisfaction of library clientele and the maximum utilization of resources and facilities (Gako & Laspinas, 2015).

Onuoha et al. (2013) study emphasized the importance of aligning library services with the changing needs of the users in order to achieve higher effectiveness. Their work revealed that libraries serve as repositories of knowledge, and it is vital that they organize and maintain their collections in a way that facilitates access and retrieval. Thus, utilizing modern cataloging systems, implementing effective search mechanisms, and employing qualified librarians are all crucial components of effective knowledge management in efficient organizational structures and processes are essential for library effectiveness. Also streamlining workflow, ensuring proper staffing levels, and optimizing resource allocation are all factors that contribute to the smooth operation of a library. By having well-defined roles and responsibilities, libraries can effectively manage their operations and deliver seamless services to their users. According to Adegun et al. (2015), evaluating library effectiveness requires a combination of quantitative and qualitative measures, as well as a commitment to ongoing evaluation and improvement..

Effective organization and classification of library materials enable easy retrieval and efficient use of information for researchers and patrons (Bhardwaj, 2018). Library management is indispensable for effective utilization of library resources and providing quality services to users. Library management systems facilitate seamless circulation and loan services, enhancing accessibility for users (Biswas, 2021). By employing strategies like technological integration,

user-centric approaches, collaboration, and staff capacity building, libraries can enhance access to knowledge, improve user experiences, and contribute to the dissemination and preservation

The importance of effectiveness in university libraries cannot be overemphasized. For instance, one of the major six areas assessed and scores awarded in order to attract full accreditation, interim and/or denied accreditation is university library (Okogwu & Akidi, 2022). Thus, an effective university library played an important role in ensuring that the institution passed a successful accreditation and satisfy the users. In today's digital age, university libraries embrace technology and offer digital services alongside traditional ones. This may include providing access to e-books, online databases, and other digital resources to cater to the evolving information-seeking behaviors of library patrons. However, observation has shown that most university libraries in Nigeria lack the required library services, facilities, and resources to satisfy users' needs. Hence, they cannot effectively promote successful education (Okonoko, 2022), which may also imply poor effective or ineffective library services. Whereas an ineffective library may lead to low quality or duplication of services thus resulting in waste of financial, material and human resources.

Effectiveness of university libraries, however, is perceived nowadays fraught with some challenges globally. For instance, academic libraries in America have been facing financial decline, leading to understaffing and budget cuts (Aman, 2010). This has resulted in the academic library's "heart of the university" status being disputed in the digital era of greater user choice and self-sufficiency regarding access to information. In Lebanon, academic libraries that seek accreditation have unique opportunities to think creatively about the needs and expectations of their users (Abdallah & Bilal, 2015). Also, users of a state university in the Philippines perceived the functional effectiveness of library services to be useful and very effective (Corpuz, 2020). However, the pandemic has, of course, confronted academic libraries with serious problems such as budget reductions (Frederick & Wolff-Eisenberg, 2020; Todorinova, 2021); copyright, licensing and e-textbook pricing as obstacles to digital-first access (Cox, 2020; Greenhall, 2020); and ensuring balanced and equitable implementation of hybrid working (Bergenas & Dorthe, 2023), that all contributed to library ineffectiveness.

Africa is not excluded from the stated challenges. For instance, Atuase and Maluleka (2022) studies in University of Education Winneba and University of Cape Coast have identified issues such as inadequate funding, data security, copyright issues as some impeding factors to library strategies. These issues according to Mohammed and Ibrahim (2021) sabotaged libraries' efforts to provide quality services and restricted the scope of library services for wider usage. Arthur et al. (2013) study of academic libraries among students in tertiary institutions in the Sunyani Municipality, Ghana revealed that academic libraries are faced with competition as a result of the seemingly easy-access platform offered by information communication technologies. Thus, it is apparent that the digital environment posed a threat to libraries which predominantly have printed materials.

Aboh et al. (2019) recalled that during the oil boom era, the libraries flourished. Libraries were busy filling their shelves with learning materials in order to sustain the main academic disciplines established by their parent universities. Today, the story is very different. University libraries have problems even in maintaining core collections which represent their universities' curricula and activities because of lack of money and high inflation. The problem is further worsen by the effects of the on-going economic turmoil that befell the Nigerian economy in recent times. The problem of inadequate funding has led to poor condition of services, shortage of professional staff; poor human resource management; extreme dilapidated structures and facilities; obsolete resources; difficulty in extending services to the rural areas, inadequate ICT facilities and others. Also, Okonoko et al. (2022) investigated challenges of rendering effective library services in library services to users in select university libraries in South-South, Nigeria. The study revealed that the benefits of rendering effective library services to library users are academic advancement, research, reading and promotion. The study also shows challenges for rendering of library services to library users to be obsolete materials, poor budgetary allocation, lack of infrastructural facilities and poor recruitment process. Strategies to render effective library services to library users are acquisition of current materials, adequate budget to the library, provision of infrastructures and sound recruitment of staff.

Personnel commitment is another factor this study perceived may have influence on effectiveness of public university libraries. The choice of library personnel commitment is borne out of perception that university libraries are faced with ever-increasing competition. The

appointment of library personnel is thus critical, but of even greater significance is the university's library ability to create a committed personnel. Hence, the need for university libraries to understand the concept of commitment - what it is, how it operates, and most importantly, which behaviours are displayed by personnel committed to the university library? Thus, Adeyoyin and Ashava (2024) in their study stressed that recruiting, teaching, and maintaining librarians, as well as the need to recruit and retain competent library leadership, are key issues for the future. Despite the fact that retirements appeared to be on the rise, fewer librarians are entering the profession, particularly at academic libraries. It is a challenge for the profession to provide the education of new librarians and the reeducation of existing librarians with skills and knowledge to support new jobs in the digital information era, particularly roles involving teaching and library promotion.

Commitment is defined as a person's belief in a cause and pursuing the cause willingly, intentionally, voluntarily, actively, passionately and relentlessly. Thus employees' commitment represents the willingness of employees to make efforts for the benefit of the organization and the desire to remain in them (Đorđević et al., 2020). When an employee is committed to his/her work, it will result to a steady and creative labour force. Employee commitment is perceived as involvement in a particular organisation and beliefs in the organisation's values, goals, sense of loyalty, moral obligation and the need to stay in the organization. Library personnel commitment thus refers to personnel emotional attachment to, identification with and involvement in an organization as well as willingness among library personnel in Southern Nigeria to remain in their organization. It is, however, possible for a commitment to wane, especially if the initial basis for commitment is not sustained or improved upon according to a person's perception and understanding (Ezeudu, 2022). According to Akinyemi and Ifijeh (2013) for libraries to achieve their objectives, they require human resources made up of individuals of various cadres. These individuals can be professionals (librarians) or paraprofessionals (library officers). Hence, they are referred to as library personnel. The commitment of the library personnel could have a great impact on the total services that are rendered in the system.

Idrees et al. (2020) in their work saw library personnel commitment as the ability of the librarian to stay and perform his job effectively, maintaining full loyalty, involvement and identification, despite the shortcomings of his job such as challenges of achievement,

recognition, advancement, social relationship, working condition and welfare benefits which consequently may affect his job satisfaction level. It therefore means that, a librarian as a professional could be as committed to his profession as well as the library or institution in which he works. Idrees et al. (2020) indicated that the job satisfaction of information professionals positively predicted their organizational commitment. It meant that job satisfaction is a preparatory ground for organizational commitment and only satisfied workers are committed and productive workers who are assets of the organization. The retention of satisfied and committed workers enable organizations to become innovative, entrepreneurial, and competitive.

Today, academic libraries are faced with increased competition for resources, new user expectations and service demands, a more global outlook, and an imperative to harness technology effectively rather than be bypassed by it (Cox, 2023). Thus to be able to meet the expectations and service demands by users of university libraries and other challenges, personnel commitment is very imperative to the library effectiveness. The success of the library is determined by the extent to which library personnel are dedicated and committed to the library goals and objectives as well as to the institution as a whole (Ile & Ikonne, 2021). Library personnel in this context are staff working in the university library that facilitates and provides library services to users.

According to Udofia and Ibegwam (2019), visits to some university libraries, backed by evidence from previous research, revealed that librarians experience low levels commitment as reflected in the high rates of turnover and absenteeism. This low level of commitment to job and organisation seems prevalent at a time Nigeria as a country is grappling with harsh economic realities, when increased commitment and extra effort are being expected of library employees to boost performance and improve effective service delivery. As university libraries prepare for new challenges, one of the key components of survival is maintaining and upgrading the libraries' ability to use human resources effectively and efficiently. Employee behaviour essential for organisational effectiveness includes employees: entering and remaining with the organisation, carrying out specific role requirements, and engaging in innovative and spontaneous activity that goes beyond role prescriptions.

Amune (2015) carried out a comparative study of the relative merits of employee commitment among the academic librarians in Nigerian public and private universities. The study utilized the expose-facto survey design to evaluate the relative merits of employee commitment among academic librarians in Nigerian public and private universities. In a bid to effectively carry out this study, the descriptive research design was adopted. The data collected were analyzed using simple percentages, t-test and F- ratio. The findings revealed that academic librarians in public and private universities have affective, continuance and normative commitment to their institutions. It was also observed that public university academic librarians are highly more committed to their institutions than the private ones as evidence by the calculated mean, t-test and F- ratio. Jan and

Ahmad (2022) studied the possible result of librarians' professional commitment on the delivery of quality library services in Pakistan environment. The paper aim was to investigate the relationship between professional commitment and library customers' perceived service quality of the respective libraries. The study was a quantitative study based on questionnaire survey. A cross-sectional design was adopted for the study in which data were collected from two different populations (i.e. professional librarians and their library customers) having a common facet that is library. The study found that Librarians were committed on the Professional Commitment Scale (PCS). The studied professional librarians showed higher commitment on the affective commitment dimension than that of continuance commitment of PCS. A positively significant relationship was found to appear between professional commitment and library service quality Adeyoyin and Ashava (2024) investigated the organizational commitment of library personnel in selected academic libraries in Ogun State, Nigeria. The study used research design. Multistage sampling technique which involved both stratified and purposive sampling techniques was used to select the tertiary institutions for the study while total enumeration technique was used to determine the population of the study. The population of the study comprised 222 library personnel. Findings showed that the working environment of library personnel in the study area was good and their promotion was regular. More so, the factors that influence organisational commitment such as cordial relationship in the work place, annual leave and promotion as and when due and good condition of service were high. Conducive

environments, career advancement, recognition among the colleague, future prospect were the most factors that promote organisational commitment among library personnel.

Ajibare et al. (2023) examined the challenges affecting librarians' commitment in South-West universities, Nigeria. The study adopted a survey research design and the population consisted of 477 librarians in South-West, Nigeria. Proportionate stratified sampling technique was used to select 217 librarians who served as the respondents in the study. Questionnaire was used for data collection and collected data were subjected to analysis. Librarians' commitment was constrained by poor reward system (82.1%) and lack of support from the organization (77.6%). The study concluded that librarians' commitment is important because they contribute to organizational success. Kadir et al. (2018) study aimed to examine the relationships between six posited library benchmarking elements with its effectiveness of library benchmarking adoption among academic libraries of public universities in Klang Valley, Malaysia. Significant positive relationships shown by some elements witnessed the strongest correlation being between the effectiveness of library benchmarking adoption and employee participation with  $r = 0.502$ . This showed that library staff are giving their support in achieving effective benchmarking and are as well giving their commitment toward improving the quality of library services.

Badmus et al. (2022) investigated level of job satisfaction and its influence on personnel commitment in university libraries in South-West, Nigeria. The study used descriptive survey research design. The population of the study comprised of 1,163 personnel from public and private university libraries in South-West, Nigeria, out of which 643 personnel were sampled using multistage sampling technique. The instrument used for data collection was questionnaire. Data collected were presented and analyzed using both descriptive and inferential statistics. Results indicated that level of job satisfaction was high in term of nature of work (Mean = 3.87), promotion opportunities (Mean = 3.30), Supervision (Mean = 3.14) and communication flow (Mean = 3.45). Also, the results revealed that job satisfaction significantly influenced personnel commitment in university libraries ( $p \leq 0.05$ ).

Adegbaye et al. (2021) and Adegbaye et al. (2020) stressed that affective commitment is considered germane to the achievement of the goals of university libraries. The authors studied job characteristics dimensions and librarians' affective commitment. According to them,

commitment of library personnel may be affected by certain fundamental psychological factors such as job characteristics which existing studies have not given adequate attention to in public universities in South-South Nigeria. Thus, the study approached the gap from the job characteristics dimensions to affective commitment. The study adopted survey research design, and data gathered from 515 librarians in public universities in South-South Nigeria using total enumeration. Findings from the descriptive statistics showed that affective commitment among librarians in public universities in South-South Nigeria was high ( $M=3.86$ ); librarians' job contains job characteristics dimensions to a high extent ( $M=4.01$ ). The multiple regression analysis conducted revealed that job characteristics dimensions had a significant influence on librarians' affective commitment ( $\text{Adj. } R = 0.166$ ,  $F(5, 394) = 6.394$ ;  $p < 0.05$ ).

Ile and Ikonne (2021) studied the influence of job satisfaction on commitment of librarians in federal university libraries in South-South, Nigeria. The study was adjudged to be necessary because it had been observed that lack of commitment had become a major issue for many organizations including university libraries and job satisfaction is pointed as an important means by which librarians' commitment can be improved. The results show a high level of librarians' commitment ( $\bar{x}=2.86$ ) and job satisfaction ( $\bar{x}=2.86$ ). Job satisfaction significantly influenced librarians' commitment in federal universities in South-South, Nigeria ( $\beta = 0.511$ ,  $t = 8.641$ ,  $p < 0.05$ ). In addition, the relative influence showed that hygiene factors ( $\beta = 0.561$ ,  $t = 6.346$ ,  $p < 0.05$ ) had a positive significant influence on librarians' commitment; while motivation factors did not significantly influence librarians' commitment ( $\beta = -0.016$ ,  $t = -0.181$ ,  $p > 0.05$ ).

Commitment of librarians among other factors is important. Library users attach top priority not only to the reliability of the service but more importantly on the responsive assistance from service personnel (Manjunatha & Shivalingaiah, 2004). The first point of contact in the library is therefore critical to superior service delivery. This applies to library staff and personnel who are the direct point of call when patrons visit the library. Librarians with the requisite knowledge, skills, competence, and efficiency constitute the core and critical resource of any public library. According to Snell and Bohlander (2015) librarians' level of capability including their skills and knowledge leads to the effectiveness of the library. Qualified staff are thus needed in this knowledge based profession where the needs of patrons keep on changing

(Asante & Alemna, 2015). Certainly, the knowledge acquired and its application served as the basis for quality library services delivery. Hence, for public libraries to ensure quality service delivery to patrons, having qualified, effective, and high performing staff are imperative (Kont & Jantson, 2013). Udofia and Ibegwam (2019) study indicated that librarians' levels of organisational commitment may not be continuous or consistent and may possibly wane if the present work situation is not sustained or improved upon. As observed in the literature, it is possible for a commitment to wane, especially if the initial basis for commitment is not sustained or improved upon. Their research also indicated that lengthy tenure in an organisation based on continuance commitment without genuine affiliation and involvement in the organisation by members seems detrimental to organisational goal of high productivity and quality service delivery. Although, many institutions, including academic libraries' assertion are that employees are their greatest asset and agents of success, thus, the notion of employee continuance commitment, which is a dimension of commitment is often overlooked. The implication for management of university libraries is that, although the library employees' lengthy association with the organisation may, in fact, increase the number and importance of benefits that are dependent on continued membership, such as pensions plan, medical benefits and friendship network, this particular strategy may not necessarily translate to higher commitment to job and organisation.

## Research Method

Survey research design was adopted for the study. The population consisted 482 librarians from 15 libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria. Total enumeration was used. A structured and validated questionnaire was used to collect data from the respondents. Cronbach's alpha reliability coefficients for the constructs ranged from 0.84 to 0.92. A response rate of 83 percent was achieved. Data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential (multiple regression) statistics at 5% significant level.

## Results and Discussion

**Table 4.1: Response rate**

| No | University                          | Administered | Returned | Response Rate (%) |
|----|-------------------------------------|--------------|----------|-------------------|
| 1  | Adekunle Ajasin University, Akungba | 16           | 13       | 81.25             |

|              |                                                                                               |            |            |              |
|--------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|------------|--------------|
|              | Akoko, Ondo State                                                                             |            |            |              |
| 2            | Adeyemi Federal University of Education, Ondo, Ondo State                                     | 15         | 11         | 73.33        |
| 3            | Bamidele Olomilua University of Education, Science and Technology, Ikere – Ekiti, Ekiti State | 19         | 12         | 63.2         |
| 4            | Ekiti State University, Ado – Ekiti, Ekiti State                                              | 28         | 26         | 92.9         |
| 5            | Federal University of Technology, Akure, Ondo State                                           | 19         | 19         | 100          |
| 6            | Federal University, Abeokuta, Ogun State                                                      | 37         | 29         | 78.4         |
| 7            | Federal University, Oye – Ekiti, Ekiti State                                                  | 14         | 12         | 85.7         |
| 8            | Ladoke University of Science and Technology, Ogbomoso, Oyo State                              | 30         | 23         | 76.7         |
| 9            | Lagos State University, Lagos State                                                           | 32         | 25         | 78.12        |
| 10           | Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile – Ife, Osun State                                             | 49         | 35         | 71.42        |
| 11           | Olabisi Onabanjo University, Ago – Iwoye, Ogun State                                          | 54         | 47         | 87.03        |
| 12           | Osun State University, Oshogbo, Osun State                                                    | 20         | 17         | 85           |
| 13           | Tai Solarin University, Ijebu – Ode, Ogun State                                               | 28         | 25         | 89.29        |
| 14           | University of Ibadan, Oyo State                                                               | 63         | 56         | 88.89        |
| 15           | University of Lagos, Lagos State                                                              | 58         | 54         | 93.1         |
| <b>Total</b> |                                                                                               | <b>482</b> | <b>396</b> | <b>82.2%</b> |

**Research Question one:** What is the level of effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria?

**Table 1**

*Level of Library Effectiveness of Libraries in Public Universities*

| <b>Effectiveness of Libraries of libraries in public universities</b>                                                                                                                          | <b>VHL</b> | <b>HL</b> | <b>ML</b> | <b>LL</b> | <b>VLL</b> | <b>Mean</b> | <b>SD</b>        |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|------------|-------------|------------------|
|                                                                                                                                                                                                | %          | %         | %         | %         | %          |             |                  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                | 5          | 4         | 3         | 2         | 1          |             |                  |
| <p><i>*Note the elliptical statements are meant to be completed from the choice of options VHL-Very High Level, HL- High Level, ML- Moderate Level, LL- Low Level, VLL- Very Low Level</i></p> |            |           |           |           |            |             |                  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                |            |           |           |           |            |             | <b>3.57 .898</b> |

**Finance**

**My library:**

|                                                                                                           |          |           |           |          |        |             |             |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|--------|-------------|-------------|
| Allocates resources in a cost effective way to a...                                                       | 71(17.9) | 143(36.1) | 142(35.8) | 35(8.8)  | 5(1.2) | 3.64        | .897        |
| Increases income from sources such as institutional budgets, grants, donations, user fees etc. is to a... | 55(13.8) | 161(40.6) | 142(35.8) | 32(8.0)  | 6(1.5) | 3.59        | .903        |
| My library ensures financial stability in provision of resources to a...                                  | 70(17.6) | 150(37.8) | 126(31.8) | 45(11.3) | 5(1.2) | 3.59        | .934        |
| Provides sufficient funding to achieve the library goals is to a...                                       | 63(15.9) | 139(35.1) | 161(40.6) | 30(7.5)  | 3(0.7) | 3.56        | .900        |
| Library budget spent for resources is to a...                                                             | 47(11.8) | 168(42.4) | 142(35.8) | 34(8.5)  | 5(1.2) | 3.54        | .846        |
| Puts in place accountability systems to deal with cases of corruption to a...                             | 54(13.6) | 161(40.6) | 139(35.1) | 36(9.09) | 6(1.5) | 3.51        | .905        |
|                                                                                                           |          |           |           |          |        | <b>3.56</b> | <b>.913</b> |

**Internal Process****My library:**

|                                                                                             |          |           |           |          |        |      |      |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|--------|------|------|
| Provision of Information Technology (IT) facilities in my library is to a...                | 65(16.4) | 167(42.1) | 122(30.8) | 33(8.3)  | 9(2.2) | 3.61 | .902 |
| Collection Processes of information resources is to a...                                    | 50(12.6) | 175(44.2) | 128(32.3) | 38(9.5)  | 5(1.2) | 3.59 | .881 |
| Organization of library materials to facilitate the easy retrieval of each item is to a ... | 61(15.4) | 140(35.3) | 152(38.3) | 36(9.0)  | 7(1.7) | 3.57 | .912 |
| Interlibrary Loan (ILL) services is to a ...                                                | 61(15.4) | 138(34.8) | 150(37.8) | 38(9.5)  | 9(2.2) | 3.54 | .925 |
| Provision of research assistance in accessing relevant information sources is to a...       | 63(15.9) | 142(35.8) | 154(38.8) | 29(7.3)  | 8(2.0) | 3.54 | .925 |
| Preservation of library resources is to a                                                   | 49(12.3) | 148(37.3) | 147(37.1) | 43(10.8) | 9(2.2) | 3.52 | .932 |
| Circulation processes is to a ...                                                           | 44(11)   | 148(37.3) | 149(37.6) | 48(12.1) | 7(1.8) | 3.49 | .915 |

**Innovation and Growth****My Library:**

|                                                                           |          |           |           |          |        |      |      |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|--------|------|------|
| Development of highly qualified effective library personnel is to a ...   | 72(18.1) | 154(38.8) | 136(34.3) | 31(7.8)  | 3(0.7) | 3.63 | .931 |
| Provision of information skills training for entire community is to a ... | 70(17.6) | 156(39.3) | 126(31.8) | 50(12.6) | 4(1.0) | 3.62 | .910 |
| Promotion of digitization for use of e-resources is to a ...              | 43(10.8) | 159(40.2) | 143(36.1) | 63(15.9) | 8(2.0) | 3.40 | .947 |
| Collaboration with faculties for depositing scholarly works is to a ...   | 29(7.3)  | 158(39.8) | 132(33.3) | 68(17.2) | 9(2.2) | 3.37 | .913 |
| Development of innovative infrastructure for effective library is to      | 37(9.3)  | 146(36.8) | 132(33.3) | 74(18.6) | 7(1.8) | 3.37 | .923 |

|                                                                        |         |           |           |          |        |             |             |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|-----------|-----------|----------|--------|-------------|-------------|
| a...                                                                   |         |           |           |          |        |             |             |
| Implementation of strategy to grow high quality collections is to a... | 24(6.1) | 153(38.6) | 143(36.1) | 70(17.6) | 6(1.5) | 3.32        | .941        |
| <b>Overall Mean</b>                                                    |         |           |           |          |        | <b>3.46</b> | <b>.929</b> |

Source: researcher's field work, 2024

Key: VHL – Very High Level, HL – High level, ML – Moderate Level, LL - Low level, VLL - Very Low Level.

**Decision rule:** 1-1.79= very low level, 1.80-2.59=low level, 2.60-3.39=moderate level, 3.40-4.19=high level, 4.20-5.0=very high level.

Table 1 displayed the result of the descriptive analysis carried out to find out the level of effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria. Based on respondents' view, the grand mean revealed that the level of effectiveness of public university libraries is high ( $M=3.46$ ,  $SD=.929$ ). The result also showed that level of finance in public university libraries is high ( $M=3.57$ ), in which the respondents indicated that their libraries allocates resources in a cost effective way ( $M=3.61$ ). Similarly, the level of internal process was also found to be high ( $M=3.56$ ), as the participants indicated that the provision of Information Technology (IT) facilities in library is to a high level ( $M=3.64$ ). Innovation and growth level of the libraries is high ( $M=3.52$ ), as the respondents indicated that development of highly qualified effective library personnel is to a high level ( $M=3.63$ ). This analysis implied that the measures provided how the libraries would generate funds or resources in other to maintain strong and sustainable services, how the libraries will enable them to be focused on how to satisfy the library users or customer, how they have to embark on operations that can add or create value to the overall growth of the libraries and incorporates training of employees and empowering them with adequate knowledge that will enable them cope with challenges of future changes and improvement.

The result of the analysis corroborated Adegun et al. (2015) that expressed library effectiveness as about each personnel in the library doing everything they know how to do and doing it well to produce the desired results with minimum expenditure of energy, time, money, human and material resources. Thus, achieving effectiveness in library services is considered as the basic responsibility of the library management because ineffectiveness of the library services is perhaps the major reason why users may not adequately utilize the libraries nowadays. Perhaps the reason why Mukherjee (2021) held that efficient utilization of resources improves productivity, helping organizations to achieve more with fewer resources, thereby substantially reducing operational costs. Thus, the

emphasis of Hossain and Islam (2021) of the need for goal alignment, resource optimization, and user-centered approaches to measure and improve effectiveness in the context of libraries. Therefore, university library is expected to establish an ideal goal to become an appropriate measure of effectiveness. The result is further supported by Okonoko et al. 2022 that found out in their study that the benefits of rendering effective library services to library users are academic advancement, research, reading and promotion.

**Research question two:** What is the level of personnel commitment in libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria?

**Table 2**

*Level of Personnel Commitment in Libraries in Public Universities*

| Personnel commitment in library                                                                                                                                                       | VHL       | HL        | ML        | LL       | VLL      | Mean        | SD          |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|-------------|-------------|
| Kindly indicate the level commitment in your library                                                                                                                                  | (%)<br>5  | (%)<br>4  | (%)<br>3  | (%)<br>2 | (%)<br>1 |             |             |
| <i>*Note the elliptical statements are meant to be completed from the choice of options VHL-Very High Level, HL-High Level, ML- Moderate Level, LL-Low Level, VLL- Very Low Level</i> |           |           |           |          |          |             |             |
| <b>Affective Commitment</b>                                                                                                                                                           |           |           |           |          |          | <b>3.81</b> | <b>.882</b> |
| I enjoy discussing about my library with people outside it to a...                                                                                                                    | 135(34.1) | 153(38.6) | 97(24.5)  | 5(1.3)   | 6(1.5)   | 3.92        | .881        |
| I do feel emotionally 'attached' to my library is to a...                                                                                                                             | 130(32.8) | 139(35.1) | 104(26.3) | 7(1.8)   | 6(1.5)   | 3.91        | .892        |
| I would be happy to spend the rest of my career in this library is to a...                                                                                                            | 103(26.)  | 145(36.1) | 125(31.5) | 4(1.0)   |          | 3.88        | .797        |
| I do feel a strong sense of belonging to my library is to a...                                                                                                                        | 129(32.5) | 148(37.3) | 106(26.7) | 7(1.8)   | 6(1.5)   | 3.97        | .887        |
| I really feel that my library's problems are my own is to a...                                                                                                                        | 126(31.8) | 133(33.5) | 125(31.5) | 6(1.5)   | 6(1.5)   | 3.86        | .958        |
| My library has a great deal of personal meaning for me is to a...                                                                                                                     | 87(21.9)  | 153(38.6) | 107(27.0) | 49(12.3) |          | 3.71        | .922        |
| <b>Normative Commitment</b>                                                                                                                                                           |           |           |           |          |          | <b>3.75</b> | <b>.887</b> |
| I would feel guilty if I leave my present library is to a...                                                                                                                          | 131(33.1) | 144(36.3) | 109(27.5) | 7(1.8)   | 5(1.3)   | 3.98        | .906        |
| My library deserves my loyalty is to a...                                                                                                                                             | 131(33.1) | 140(35.3) | 112(28.2) | 7(1.8)   | 6(1.5)   | 3.97        | .909        |
| I owe a great deal of my personal achievement to my library is to a...                                                                                                                | 98(24.7)  | 131(33.1) | 132(33.3) | 26(6.6)  | 9(2.2)   | 3.76        | .890        |

|                                                                                                |           |           |           |          |         |             |             |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|----------|---------|-------------|-------------|
| I feel an obligation to remain with my current employer is to a...                             | 76(19.1)  | 155(39.1) | 130(32.8) | 32(8.1)  | 3(0.7)  | 3.66        | .888        |
| My feeling of letting my co-workers down if I leave this library is to a...                    | 63(15.9)  | 144(36.4) | 152(38.3) | 37(9.3)  |         | 3.61        | .849        |
| My library deserves my loyalty because of its treatment towards me is to a...                  | 63(15.9)  | 138(34.8) | 149(37.6) | 41(10.3) | 5(1.2)  | 3.55        | .880        |
|                                                                                                |           |           |           |          |         | <b>3.55</b> | <b>.911</b> |
| <b>Continuance Commitment</b>                                                                  |           |           |           |          |         |             |             |
| It wouldn't be too costly for me to leave the library now to a...                              | 139(35.1) | 146(36.8) | 41(10.3)  | 70(17.6) |         | 3.66        | .885        |
| Leaving this organisation right now will disrupt the plans I have for myself is to a...        | 149(37.6) | 132(33.3) | 75(18.9)  | 31(7.8)  | 9(2.3)  | 3.91        | .898        |
| My commitment to my library makes it difficult to work elsewhere to a...                       | 159(40.6) | 67(16.9)  | 123(31.0) | 40(10.1) | 7(1.8)  | 3.63        | .896        |
| Staying with my present library is a matter of necessity is to...                              | 130(32.8) | 157(39.1) | 70(17.7)  | 29(7.3)  | 10(2.5) | 3.60        | .935        |
| It will be difficult for me to leave my library even when opportunity exists elsewhere to a... | 127(32.1) | 85(21.4)  | 140(35.3) | 44(11.1) |         | 3.69        | .903        |
| Scarcity of alternative jobs makes it difficult to leave my present job to a...                | 46(11.6)  | 134(33.8) | 148(47.3) | 65(16.4) | 3(0.6)  | 3.59        | .906        |
|                                                                                                |           |           |           |          |         | <b>3.66</b> | <b>.890</b> |

**Source: researcher's field work, 2024**

Key: VHL – Very High Level, HL – High level, ML – Moderate Level, LL - Low level, VLL - Very Low Level.

**Decision rule:** 1-1.79= very low level, 1.80-2.59=low level, 2.60-3.39=moderate level, 3.40-4.19=high level, 4.20-5.0=very high level

The result presented on Table 2 reveals participants view on the level of personnel commitment in libraries in public universities in south-west, Nigeria. The result revealed that the level of personnel commitment is high ( $M=3.66$ ,  $SD=.890$ ). The result further explained that the level of affective commitment was high ( $M=3.81$ ), the level of normative commitment is high ( $M=3.75$ ), as well as level of continuance commitment ( $M=3.55$ ). On affective commitment, the result revealed that the respondents indicated that they enjoy discussing about their library with people outside to a high level ( $M=3.91$ ), and that they felt emotionally 'attached' to the library was to a high level ( $M=3.92$ ), hence, they would be happy to spend the rest of their career in the library to a high level ( $M=3.98$ ), because they felt a strong sense of belonging to the library to a high level ( $M=3.97$ ). Under Normative commitment, the respondents indicated that they would feel guilty

if they leave their present library to a high level ( $M=3.88$ ) and that to a high level, their libraries deserve their loyalty ( $M=3.97$ ), and that they owed a great deal of their personal achievement to the library ( $M=3.76$ ). On continuance commitment, the respondents indicated that to a high level, it would not be too costly for them to leave the library now ( $M=3.66$ ), though leaving this organisation right now would disrupt the plans they have to a high level ( $M=3.91$ ), because, their commitment to their library made it difficult to work elsewhere to a high level ( $M=3.63$ ). Overall, the result implied that personnel in public university libraries were committed to the library.

The result revealed that the level of personnel commitment is high which implies that personnel in public university libraries are committed to the library and to their services. Lending credence to this, Ile and Ikonne (2021) averred that success of the library is determined by the extent to which library personnel are dedicated and committed to the library goals and objectives as well as to the institution as a whole. Corroborating this as well, Amune (2015) revealed that academic librarians in public and private universities have affective, continuance and normative commitment to their institutions. The result is further corroborated by Idrees et.al (2020) who in their study saw library personnel commitment as the ability of the librarian to stay and perform his job effectively, maintaining full loyalty, involvement and identification, despite the shortcomings of the job such as challenges of achievement, recognition, advancement, social relationship, working condition and welfare benefits which consequently may affect job satisfaction level. It therefore means that, a library personnel could be as committed to his profession as well as the library in which he works. In support of this result, Kadir et.al (2018) affirmed that significant positive relationships shown by some elements witnessed the strongest correlation being between the effectiveness of library benchmarking adoption and employee participation with  $r = 0.502$ . This shows that library staff are giving their support in achieving effective benchmarking and are as well giving their commitment toward improving the quality of library services.

**Research Question Three:** What are the challenges of effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South West, Nigeria?

**Table 3**

*Challenges of Library Effectiveness in Libraries in Public Universities*

| Challenges Faced                                                | Yes<br>Freq. (%)<br>(%) | No<br>Freq. |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------|
| Insufficient funding                                            | 305(77)                 | 91(23)      |
| Difficulty in allocating resources effectively                  | 296(75)                 | 100(25)     |
| Personnel wages are not competitive                             | 282(71)                 | 114(29)     |
| Infrastructural development is poor                             | 276(70)                 | 120(30)     |
| Professional development is poor                                | 213(54)                 | 183(46)     |
| Collections are inadequate                                      | 210(53)                 | 186(47)     |
| Personnel administration is imperfect                           | 205(52)                 | 191(48)     |
| Staying with current emerging technologies and digital are poor | 198(50)                 | 198(50)     |
| Lack of collaboration with other departments                    | 190(47.6)               | 206(52.4)   |
| Personnel inefficiency                                          | 175(44.5)               | 221(55.5)   |

**Source: researcher's field work, 2024**

Presented on Table 3 are the challenges of effectiveness experienced in libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria. The result revealed that 305 (77%) indicated that funding was insufficient, 296 (75%) that there was difficulty in allocating resources effectively and 282 (71%) of the respondents affirmed that personnel wages are not competitive. Also, 276 (70%) of the respondents indicated that infrastructural development is poor while 213 (54%) of the respondents confirmed that collections are inadequate. The result further revealed that 210 (53%), 205 (52%), 198(50), 190 (50), 175 (44%) indicated imperfect personnel administration, poor digital emerging technologies, lack of collaboration with other departments and personnel inefficiency respectively. Thus the result invariably implied that numerous challenges hinder effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria.

### Hypothesis

**Hypothesis one:** Personnel commitment has no significant influence on effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria.

**Table 4**

*Influence of Personnel Commitment on Effectiveness of Libraries in Public Universities.*

| Variables            | B     | Std. Error | B    | T     | Sig. | R <sup>2</sup> | Adj. R <sup>2</sup> | F (df)   | ANOVA Sig. |
|----------------------|-------|------------|------|-------|------|----------------|---------------------|----------|------------|
| (Constant)           | 3.405 | 3.556      |      | 2.088 | .036 | .602           | .630                | (3, 407) | .000       |
| Affective Commitment | .443  | .141       | .098 | 3.146 | .002 |                |                     | 241.64   |            |

|                           |       |      |      |        |      |
|---------------------------|-------|------|------|--------|------|
| Normative<br>Commitment   | 1.201 | .183 | .268 | 6.565  | .000 |
| Continuance<br>Commitment | 2.042 | .148 | .558 | 13.769 | .000 |

**Dependent Variable:** Effectiveness of libraries in public universities

Table 4 presents the result of the test on the influence of personnel commitment on effectiveness of libraries in public universities in south-west, Nigeria. The result revealed that personnel commitment ( $dj.R^2 = 0.630$ ,  $F(3, 407) = 241.64$ ,  $p < 0.05$ ). significantly influenced effectiveness of libraries in public universities in south-west, Nigeria. This implied that this regression model could explain 63% of the variations in library effectiveness and that the indicators of the variable in this study can influence the effectiveness of libraries in public universities in south-west, Nigeria. The study also revealed that affective commitment ( $\beta=.098$ ,  $t(407) = 3.146$ ,  $p<0.05$ ), had 9.8% influence on effectiveness in libraries in public universities; normative commitment ( $\beta=.268$ ,  $t(407) = 6.565$ ,  $p<0.05$ ), had 26.8% influence on effectiveness of libraries in public universities; while continuance commitment ( $\beta=.558$ ,  $t(407) = 13.769$ ,  $p<0.05$ ), had 55.8% influence on effectiveness of libraries in libraries in public universities in south-west, Nigeria. The null hypothesis is therefore rejected and restated thus: Personnel commitment has significant influence on effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria.

The result of multiple regression analysis in this assumption disproved the statement in that the variations in effectiveness of libraries can be accounted for by personnel commitment. The result revealed that personnel commitment significantly influenced effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria. This implied that this regression model could explain 63% of the variations in library effectiveness and that the indicators of the variable in this study can influence the effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West, Nigeria. The success of the library is determined by the extent to which library personnel are dedicated and committed to the library goals and objectives as well as to the institution as a whole (Ile & Ikonne, 2021). When they fail to do so, the librarians would likely have low commitment which makes the achievement of organisational goals difficult. Ajibare et.al (2023) in tandem with this result revealed that librarians' commitment is important because they contribute to organizational success.

## Recommendation

The following are recommended to enhance the effectiveness of university libraries:

1. Management should encourage library personnel to participate in decision making processes and provide feedback on policies and procedures in order advance effectiveness of libraries in the public universities.
2. Management should devise strategies of raising substantial fund to fund the libraries
3. Library management should foster a positive work environment that encourages teamwork, collaboration, and a sense of ownership
4. Management should recognize and reward staff contributions in order to motivate and retain committed personnel
5. Management should offer training, workshops, and opportunities for professional growth to enhance employees' skills and knowledge.

## Conclusion

The effectiveness of university libraries is crucial to its success in meeting the needs of its users. Personnel are the backbone of effective university libraries, responsible for managing collections, assisting patrons, and fostering a conducive learning environment. Personnel level of commitment, enthusiasm, and expertise can significantly impact the library's ability to meet the evolving needs of its users. The study was anchored on investigation to the influence of personnel commitment on effectiveness of libraries in public universities in South-West of Nigeria. It was empirically established in this study that personnel commitment has significant influence on effectiveness in libraries of public universities. Nonetheless, some challenges that hindered effectiveness of libraries in the public universities were identified and these inadequacies deserve urgent attention through synergy of university and library management.

## References

- Abdallah, F. & Bilal, D. (2015). Exploring the effectiveness of library services and resources in academic libraries in Lebanon from users' perspective. *IFLA WLIC*. <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/>

- Aboh, S. O., Oname, I. M., & Isaac, A. U. (2019). Effects of economic recession on universities libraries in Nigeria: A Review Approach. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 2783. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/2783>
- Adegbaye, S. I., Babalola, Y. T., & Alegbeleye, G. O. (2020). Job characteristics dimensions and librarians' affective commitment. *International Journal of Development Strategies in Humanities, Management and Social Sciences*, 10(1), 36-54.
- Adegbaye, S. I., Agboola, I. O., & Buraimo, O. (2021). Organizational commitment among university library personnel: A demographic analysis. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 5397.
- Adegun, A., Oyewumi, O., Oladapo, Y., & Sobalaje, A. J. (2015). Effectiveness of library service and resources in an African university. *Information and Knowledge Management*, 5 (3), [www.iiste.org](http://www.iiste.org)
- Adewusi, F. A. and Haliso, Yacob (2022). The influence of information seeking patterns on managerial effectiveness of academic heads of departments in public university libraries in South-West, Nigeria. *Information Impact: Journal of Information and knowledge Management*, 13(1), 34 – 50. <http://dx.doi.org/10.4314/ijikm.v13i1.4>.
- Ajibare, O. O., Fagbemiro, A. O., & Adewolojo, A. A. (2023). Challenges to librarians' commitment in universities in South-West, Nigeria. *Journal of Library Services and Technologies*, 5(1), 48 – 55. doi.10.47524/jlst.v5i1.49
- Akinyemi, N. & Ifijeh, G. I. (2013). Leadership style and job commitment of library personnel in universities: A study of private university libraries in Southwest Nigeria. *Information Impact*, 4(1), 93 – 104. [ajol-file-journals\\_564\\_articles\\_144614\\_submission\\_proof\\_144614-6625-383249-1-10-20160927](https://ajol-file-journals_564_articles_144614_submission_proof_144614-6625-383249-1-10-20160927)
- Aman, M. M. (2010). "Academic library management issues and practices". School of Information Studies. Faculty Books. Global Information Co. [https://dc.uwm.edu/sois\\_](https://dc.uwm.edu/sois_) <http://www.vcu.edu/cie/pdfs/vcu2020>
- Amune, J. B. (2015). A comparative study of the relative merits of employee commitment among the academic librarians in Nigerian public and private universities. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business & Social Sciences*, 5(5), 1-11
- Arthur, C., Brafi, P. O & Kuranchie, A. (2013). The use of academic libraries among students in tertiary institutions in the Sunyani Municipality, Ghana. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 4 (2). [www.iiste.org](http://www.iiste.org).

- Asante, E and Alemna, A (2015), Training and development issues: Evidence from polytechnic libraries in Ghana. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. Paper 1221. <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/1221>.
- Asante, E., Baayel, P., & Budu, K., & Wilson, A. (2020). Determinants of quality performance of library staff of academic libraries. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 3973. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/3973>
- Badmus, I. T., Alhassan, J. A. & Ahmed, A. O. (2022). Job satisfaction as predictor of personnel commitment in university libraries in South–West, Nigeria, *International Journal of Library and Information Science Studies*, 8 (2), 53-64
- Bergenas, E., & Dorthe, L. (2023). Why the simple act of listening will help us design strong and sustainable post pandemic library services. *LIBER Quarterly: The Journal of the Association of European Research Libraries*, 31(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.18352/lq.1093>
- Blau, G. (2000). Job, organisational, professional context antecedents as predictors of intent for inter role work transitions. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 56, 330-445.
- Corpuz, D. A. (2020). Library resources and functional effectiveness of an academic library: Meeting the challenges of the digital age. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 8(4) [doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2020.8425](https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2020.8425)
- Cox, J. (2023). The position and prospects of academic libraries: Strengths and opportunities, *New Review of Academic Librarianship*, 1-27. <https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/racl20>. DOI: 10.1080/13614533.2023.223869
- Damarsari, R. E., Yulianti, R., Suyono, J., Chauhan, R. & Thakar, I. (2021). Affective commitment, continuance commitment, normative commitment, and turnover intention in Shoes Industry. *Annals of R.S.C.B.*, 25(3), 1937 – 1945. <http://annalsofrscb.ro>
- Dorđević, B., Ivanović-Dukić, M., Lepojević, V., & Milanović, S. (2020). The impact of employees' commitment on organizational performances. *Strategic Management*, 25 (3), 028-037. doi: 10.5937/StraMan2003028D
- Egwakhe, J. A., & Osabuohien, E. S. C. (2009). Educational backgrounds and youth criminality in Nigeria. *International Forum*, 12(1), 65-79
- Ezeudu, B. (2022). Self-concept as a predictor of librarians' commitment in university libraries in Southern Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 7065. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/706>
- Frederick, J. K., & Wolff-Eisenberg, C. (2020). Academic library strategy and budgeting during the COVID-19 pandemic: Results from the Ithaka S+R US library survey. New York: Ithaka S+R. <https://doi.org/10.18665/sr.314507>

- Gako, L. D. & Laspinas, M.L. (2015). The functionality of an academic library using standard for Philippine academic libraries model: Cebu Technological University; Cebu Normal University, Cebu City, Philippines. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education, Arts, and Sciences*, 2 (2), 68-75.
- Greenhall, M. (2020). Covid-19 and the digital shift in action: RLUK report. <https://www.rluk.ac.uk/covid-19-and-the-digital-shift-in-action>
- Heathfield, S. M. (2018). *How to encourage work-life balance for employees: Employers can Support employees in their efforts to balance work and life*. New York: John Wiley & Sons
- Hossain, M. J. and Islam, S. S. (2021). Planning a user-centered process improvement for academic libraries: A pathway of satisfying users' needs. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 4793. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/4793>
- Idrees, H., Naveed, M. A., & Shah, M. A (2020). Does Job satisfaction predict organizational commitment? an information professionals' perspective. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 4433. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/4433>
- Ile, O. G & Ikonne, C. N. (2021). Job satisfaction and employees' commitment in federal university libraries in South-South, Nigeria. *International Journal of Academic Research and Education Review*, 9(5), 224-233
- Jan, S. U. & Ahmad, S. (2022). Professional commitment and library-users' perceived service quality in university libraries: a survey in the Pakistani academic environment, *Global Knowledge, Memory and Communication*, 71 (8/9), 789-799. <https://doi.org/10.1108/GKMC-03-2020-0034>
- Kadir, M. R. A., Abdullah, N. A., & Hussin, N. (2018). Insights on the effectiveness of library benchmarking adoption among academic libraries. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(9), 298–31. doi: 10.6007/IJARBS/v8-i9/4592
- Kiiza, P., & Picho, E. O. (2015). Delegation and staff commitment in the school of finance and banking, Kigali, Rwanda, *Makerere Journal of Higher Education*, 7(2), 3 -13
- Kont, K .R., & Jantson, S. (2013). Library employees' attitudes towards the measurement and appraisal of their work performance: Study in Estonian university libraries. *Library Management International Journal of Sciences: Basic and Applied Research (IJSBAR)* (2022), 61 (2), 155-173
- Manjunatha. K. & Shivalingaiah. D. (2004). Customer's perception of service quality in libraries. *Annals of Library and Information Studies*, 51, 4.

- Mohammed, H. and Ibrahim, A.K. (2021), Promoting the use of library services: challenges and prospects in some Ghanaian technical universities, *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/4794>.
- Mukherjee, P. (2021). Organizational effectiveness: An overview. <https://www.investopedia.com/terms/o/organizational-effectiveness.asp>.
- Nwokike, O. A. (2019). Evaluating library materials in university libraries South-East, Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice. (e-journal)*, 2536
- Nworie, J. C., Ubochi, E. U., Iwuchukwu, C., & Njoku, C. C. (2023). Challenges and prospects of library and information services in academic libraries in Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 7630. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/7630>
- Okogwu, F. I. and Akidi, J. O. (2022). The role of university libraries in accreditation of academic programmes: Challenges and prospects. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 7134. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/7134>
- Oludeyi, O. S. (2015). *A review of literature on work environment and work commitment: implication for future research in citadels of learning*. The Department of Adult Education, the University of Ibadan, Oyo State, Nigeria. Master's dissertation
- Okonoko, N.V, Abubakar, U.N & Nwafor, R. A. (2022). Challenges of rendering effective library services in library services to users in select university libraries in South-South, Nigeria. *Information Impact: Journal of Information and Knowledge Management*, 13(2), 15-25, doi <https://dx.doi.org/10.4314/ijikm.v13i2.2>. Ala.org/tools/re.
- Bankole, Q. A. (2023). Organizational commitment and interpersonal relationship of library personnel as determinants of work performance in Nigeria universities. *Mediterranean Journal of Social & Behavioral Research*, 7(2), 75-84. <https://doi.org/10.30935/mjosbr/12843>
- Quadri, R. F. (2009). *Job satisfaction as correlate of job commitment of librarians in tertiary institution in South West Nigeria*. An unpublished Ph.D thesis of the University of Ibadan, Ibadan.
- Snell, S., Morris, S., & Bohlander, G. W. (2015). *Managing human resources*. Cengage Learning.
- Retrieved on November 12, 2021, from <https://bit.ly/34Cc7hV> [17].
- Temile, S. O. (2016). Application of Balance Scorecard at London South Bank University, United Kingdom. *International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management*, IV(4), 253. <http://ijecm.co.uk>

- Todorinova, L. (2021). One year in: A survey of public services librarians on the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic. *Journal of Library Administration*, 61(7), 776–792. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01930826.2021.1972728>
- Udofia, I & Ibegwam, A (2019). Stages of Organisational commitment among librarians in university libraries in South-South, Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 2937. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/2937>
- Umukoro, J. E. and Egwakhe, A. J. (2019). Job-characteristics dimensions and employee continuance commitment european. *Journal of Business and Management*, 11(27), 21-31 [www.iiste.org](http://www.iiste.org) doi: 10.7176/EJBM
- Xu, Y., Zhao, J., Fang, Q., Wang, H., Wang, D., Zeng, B., & Wang, Y (2022). The theory and method of organizational effectiveness evaluation. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, vol. 664. *Proceedings of the 2022 8th International Conference on Humanities and Social Science Research (ICHSSR)*
- Yadav, A., & Singh, K. C. R. (2017). The influence of job satisfaction and organizational commitment on organizational effectiveness of Indian Navy. *International Journal of Applied Business and Economic Research*, 15, 171-182. <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/> <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4428-7026> doi: 10.4018/IJHCITP.300315
- Yamoah, E. E. (2013). Relationship between compensation and employee productivity. *Singapore Journal of Business Economics and Management Studies*, 2 (1), 110-114.
- Yawson, R. M. & Paros, A. K. B. (2023). Systems perspective of the use of the Balanced Scorecard for organization development and change. *SAGE Open*, October-December, 1–5. doi: 10.1177/21582440231218064 [journals.sagepub.com/home/sgo](https://journals.sagepub.com/home/sgo)

